

REVIEW COMMITTEE DECISION

R.C. File Number 151

Colgate Division Grievance No. 2 - Lineman, Relief Troubleman Vacancy,
Oroville.

Subject of Grievance:

A Relief Troubleman job vacancy at Oroville, California, was posted for bid in the December, 1956 Employment Bulletin. Among the bidders were two Linemen from Colgate Division, both with the same classification seniority, but one (Garland Andoe) having more Company seniority than the other (Clarence Collier). The job was awarded to Collier under Section 205.14 of the Agreement, the Division claiming that he had demonstrated that he possessed ability and personal qualifications superior to those of the senior bidder, Andoe. The Union protested and the matter was investigated by the Local Investigating Committee, but no agreement could be attained. Later the grievance was referred to review and a Review Committee hearing was held in Oroville at which time Company and Union members of the Review Committee questioned several Division Supervisors and obtained statements from them with respect to the qualifications of both the employees. The Committee also talked to the grievant, Garland Andoe. Following such meeting further discussion took place among the members of the Review Committee and it was decided that the grievance should be settled as follows.

Statement and Decision:

When passing upon the qualifications of an employee this Committee's information is limited to those matters which appear in the record of the grievance. In the instant case the record shows that according to the opinions of the Company Supervisors who were interviewed at Oroville, Collier is considered the better of the two employees for public contact work. However, such opinions were not supported in the record by a recital of the factual situations which led the supervisors to their conclusions. Also, at the Review Committee hearing many questions were asked by both Union and Company representatives of the Committee in an attempt to develop a background of facts upon which a decision could be made on the merits of the case, but this effort was not successful. For this reason, Company and Union members of this Committee cannot find a common ground upon which they can agree to settle this case at this time.

Considering the above we believe it advisable, therefore, that the Division cancel the vacancy as posted in the December Employment Bulletin and fill the Relief Troubleman vacancy (one day a week) on a time card basis for a temporary period, during which time both Andoe and Collier may be assigned to the Troubleman work. A close check of the activities of the two employees, while performing the relief work, may develop factual evidence of sufficient weight to determine whether or not the opinions of the supervisors were well founded, after which the job may be posted again and awarded.

For Union:

Russell Stone, Jr.
Paul Devlin
L. L. Mitchell

By Ronald T. Westley
Date: 6-19-1957

For Company:

E. F. Sibley
C. L. Yager
V. J. Thompson

By [Signature]
Date: June 12, 1957